United Nations A/HRC/38/NGO/20

General Assembly

Distr.: General
6 June 2018

English only

Human Rights Council
Thirty-eighth session
18 June-6 July 2018
Agenda item 4
Human rights situations that require the Council's attention

Written statement* submitted by the European Centre for Law and Justice / Centre Européen pour le Droit et la Justice, a non-governmental organization in special consultative status

The Secretary-General has received the following written statement which is circulated in accordance with Economic and Social Council resolution 1996/31.

[23 May 2018]

* This written statement is issued, unedited, in the language(s) received from the submitting non-governmental organization(s).

GE.18-09126(E)

1809126

Please recycle

REQUESTING U.N. ASSIST IN THE RELEASE OF AMERICAN CITIZEN PASTOR ANDREW BRUNSON FROM WRONGFUL DETENTION AND IMPRISONMENT IN TURKEY

1. INTRODUCTION

One of the principle aims of the United Nations (U.N.), as expressed in the preamble of the 1945 United Nations Charter, is 'to reaffirm faith in fundamental human rights [and] in the dignity and worth of the human person'1. It is for this reason that the United Nations Human Rights Council (UNHRC) holds member states accountable for those significant violations of human dignity that run contrary to this aim.

The European Centre for Law and Justice (ECLJ), on behalf of Pastor Andrew Brunson, and over 568,000 people from 202 countries and territories who have signed a petition requesting his release, once again respectfully draws this Council's attention to the plight of Pastor Andrew Brunson, an American citizen, who has been unjustly and arbitrarily detained and imprisoned in Turkey for over a year and a half.

Pastor Brunson's ongoing trial in Turkey began on 16 April 2018. Turkey has made it clear that this is a sham trial, and, as indicated by President Erdoğan's multiple demands to swap Pastor Brunson for Fethullah Gülen, Pastor Brunson is undoubtedly a political prisoner being held as a bargaining chip for Turkey.

As a founding Member State of the U.N., Turkey is obligated to adhere to norms set forth in the U.N. Charter, such as those requiring members '[t]o achieve international cooperation . . . in promoting and encouraging respect for human rights and . . . fundamental freedoms . . . without distinction as to [inter alia] religion'2. Pastor Brunson's detention appears to be related to his work as a Christian minister. By detaining and imprisoning Pastor Brunson because of his religious expression, peaceful association, and assembly, Turkey is violating not only its obligations under the U.N. Charter, but its own Constitution, as well as Pastor Brunson's fundamental rights: freedom of religion and belief, freedom of expression, freedoms of peaceful assembly and association, as well as his right to due process and a fair trial. Therefore, these violations concern not only Turkey, but every Member State and every agency of the U.N.

2. BACKGROUND

For 23 years, Pastor Brunson worked openly in Izmir, Turkey, serving as the pastor of the Izmir Resurrection Church, within a small Protestant Christian community. On 7 October 2016, Pastor Brunson received a written summons to report with his passport to a local police station. Believing the summons was related to his routine renewal of his residence visa, Pastor Brunson promptly reported to the Izmir police only to be arrested, and later told that he was to be deported as a 'national security risk'. However, Pastor Brunson was never deported, he was instead transferred to the Harmandali Detention Centre and held for 63 days. During this time, he was denied access to an attorney and repeated requests by U.S. officials to visit Pastor Brunson were ignored, raising serious concerns.

On 9 December 2016, he was transferred to a prison facility as a suspect of alleged 'membership in an armed terrorist organization,' despite no evidence to justify the accusations against him. Turkey repeatedly denied Pastor Brunson's appeals for release, and, rather than accelerating his trial as Turkey's Prime Minister indicated they would in March 20173, no indictment was handed down until March 2018. The indictment against Pastor Brunson was 62 pages long,

---

1U.N. Charter, Preamble.

2U.N. Charter art. 1, para. 3. *See also* Articles 55 and 56 of the U.N. Charter.

3Oren Dorell, *Turkish PM Considers Speeding up Trial of Jailed American Pastor*, USA TODAY (9 Mar. 2017, updated 8:14 PM), https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2017/03/09/turkish-prime-minister-promises-speed-up-trial-jailed-american-pastor/98946590/.

wholly lacking in merit, and provided no evidence regarding criminal action against Pastor Brunson, but was rather replete with hearsay from secret witnesses.

On 16 April 2018, eighteen months after his imprisonment, Pastor Brunson's trial began. The first day lasted thirteen hours and was filled with video testimony of secret prosecution witnesses whose appearances and voices were disguised almost to the point of their testimony being indecipherable. At the conclusion of the first day, the 3-judge panel of Turkish judges refused to release Pastor Brunson and ordered that he be returned to the overcrowded prison where he was originally imprisoned. The judges also delayed the trial further by scheduling the next court date for *three weeks* later on 7 May 2018.

On May 7, Pastor Brunson's second day of trial lasted eleven hours, and again involved only prosecution witness testimony. Two of the seven witnesses brought by the prosecution were secret, and none of the seven witnesses testified that they had personally seen or heard Pastor Brunson do anything that would substantiate the charges against him. Their testimony was completely hearsay and conjecture. Pastor Brunson's Turkish attorney objected to the testimony of one of the witnesses against Pastor Brunson by pointing out that the witness had been convicted on 14 separate counts of fraud; however, the lead judge claimed that fact was not relevant and stated that the prosecution witnesses' statements would be taken as fact. Moreover, the lead judge has refused to allow any of the witnesses for the defence testify. According to the judge, no witness who is a suspect is allowed to testify, and he declared that the remaining witnesses have nothing relevant to say.

These actions violate Articles 9 (right to liberty and security of person), 14 (equality before the courts and tribunals), and 18 (right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion), of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) to which Turkey is a signatory, as well as Articles 7 (equality before the law and equal protection of the law), 9 (no arbitrary arrest or detention), 10 (fair and public hearing), and 11 (presumed innocent until proved guilty) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), and Article 5 (right to liberty and security of person & lawfulness of detention), and 6 (adequate time and facilities for the preparation of his defence) of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR).

Additionally, Articles 10 and 24 of the Constitution of the Republic of Turkey protect the rights of everyone to equality before the law 'without distinction as to . . . political opinion, philosophical belief, religion and sect'4, as do Articles 2 and 7 of the UDHR and Article 18 of the ICCPR. These rights include the freedom, 'either individually or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief in worship, observance, practice and teaching'5. Article 5 of the ECHR guarantees that no one shall be arbitrarily 'deprived of his liberty'6. Article 36 of Turkey's Constitution also protects the right to litigation 'before the courts through lawful means and procedure.' Turkey has violated all of these protections by arresting and detaining an innocent pastor in prison for over a year and a half based on the hearsay testimony of secret witnesses. Moreover, Turkey has denied Pastor Brunson the opportunity to mount an adequate defence by flippantly dismissing all defence witness testimony.

3. REQUEST

One of the hallmarks of Turkey's proud history is the respect for all faiths and the rule of law. Thus, Turkey should respectfully be reminded of its continuing obligations under its constitution as well as the ICCPR, UDHR, and ECHR to respect and value the freedom of religion and rule of law. The ECLJ urges this Council to call upon Turkey to honour its obligations. The ECLJ has been informed that the U.N. Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has begun an investigation of Pastor Brunson's case. The ECLJ is grateful for the Working Group's attention to this matter, and further requests that the U.N. continue to make every effort to ensure that Pastor Brunson is not only treated with great care, but that he is released and allowed to return home to the United States of America without injury or delay.

4CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF TURKEY July 23, 1995, art. 10, 24.
5ICCPR, *adopted* Dec. 16, 1966, G.A. Res. 2200A (XXI), art. 18, U.N. Doc. A/6316 (*entered into force* Mar. 23, 1976).
6ECHR, art. 6 (Nov. 4, 1950), 213 U.N.T.S. 221.

4. CONCLUSION

The U.N. has long stood to protect the human rights of all people. In intervening on behalf of Pastor Brunson, the U.N. will once again demonstrate its commitment to ensuring that freedom of religion exists for all people, regardless of their faith.